

Democratic Governance and Think Thinks: The Six Pillars to Form a Strategic Thinking in the Arab Countries

by

Mohamed Harakat

University Mohammed v –souissi – Rabat – Morocco

Director funder of Moroccan Review of Audit and development

(Revue marocaine d’audit et de développement)

President du Centre International des études stratégiques et de gouvernance globale

E-mail: harakatmohamed@yahoo.fr

IJMBE International Journal of
Management, Business, and Economics

Democratic Governance and Think Tanks: The Six Pillars to Form a Strategic Thinking in the Arab Countries

by

Mohamed Harakat

University Mohammed v –souissi – Rabat – Morocco

Director funder of Moroccan Review of Audit and development

(Revue marocaine d’audit et de développement)

President du Centre International des études stratégiques et de gouvernance globale

E-mail: harakatmohamed@yahoo.fr

Abstract

The culture of a democratic governance moves beyond the mere procedures of democracy and the establishment of democratic institutions. It involves promoting the sustainability of democracy which includes an enduring capacity for: the separation of powers and independence of the branches of government; the exercise of power in accordance with the rule of law; the respect for human rights and fundamental freedoms; and, the transparency and accountability of a responsible civil service, functioning at both the national and local levels. The legitimacy of public action in Arab countries is dependent on the creation of democratic and institutional conditions conducive to the development of TT. These conditions are manifold may include: 1) the availability of funding; 2) the existence of supportive legislation; 3) political freedom and intellectual; 4) the existence of rules of good governance; 5) the independence of the State; and 5) the existence of good governance practices. Now if some authors consider that the development of endogenous TT is hampered by the dominance of international organizations in developing public policies in developing countries with regard to abuse of the outsourcing decision in favor of including the World Bank. This study aims to highlight the main aspects of democratic governance and the role of Think tanks in this process, including the leadership of public policies in the six areas where public administration will formulating programs and work on the basis of criteria’s and clear timeframe.

Keywords: Democratic Governance, Six Pillars, Strategic Thinking

1. Introduction

“The culture of a democratic governance moves beyond the mere procedures of democracy and the establishment of democratic institutions. It involves promoting the sustainability of democracy which includes an enduring capacity for: the separation of powers and independence of the branches of government; the exercise of power in accordance with the rule of law; the respect for human rights and fundamental freedoms; and, the transparency and accountability of a responsible civil service, functioning at both the national and local levels”.

The constraints of Arabic countries on promoting democratic governance are complex, enormous and various. They are the conjunction of five essential factors:

- the lack of clarity and vision,
- The conflict of priorities and interest ,
- The weakness related to the use of knowledge and competence (cognitive governance) ,
- The absence of assessment culture and the inefficiency of decision making.

In fact, the strategic analysis is crucial in elaborating and achieving public policy in an area of globalization and crisis. In addition, to this logical approach that reasons in terms of vision, threat, risk, competence, communication, transparency and imagination (to be imaginative). The relationship is very intimate between geopolitics and geo-strategy in the process of identifying strategic thinking in the democratic global governance. For comparison, the legal framework for open government is largely in place in OECD member countries, and consist of¹:

- Laws on access to information give citizens the right to access information held by government (precondition for public scrutiny and participation)
- Laws on privacy and data protection (interest of protecting personal data)
- Laws on administrative procedures provide some guarantees for citizens in their interaction with government (mechanisms for holding administrative bodies accountable)
- Laws on ombudsman institutions establish a point of contact for citizens 'complaints , appeals and claims for redress in their dealings with government entities
- Laws of supreme audit institutions provide for an independent evaluation of public programs and projects.

2. Methodology

This communication aims to highlight the main aspects of democratic governance and the role of Think tanks in this process, including the leadership of public policies in the six areas where public administration will formulating programs and work on the basis of criteria's and clear timeframe.

The purpose of democratic governance is to achieve a balanced and sustainable development in order to ensure a high standard of living and human development.

The general strategy is based on six (06) areas:

- Leadership and strategic plan,
- Public administration and competence ,
- System of auditing and ethics,
- Local authorities,
- Think tanks and innovation,
- Reviewing and updating legislation, regulation and control.

The general principles of the strategy in the Arab countries² are as follows:

- Build a society of knowledge and innovation,
- Improve decision – making mechanism,

OECD ,government at a glance 2009,p114 ¹

² The UAE Strategy - United Arab Emirates – office of deputy Prim Minister for Information affairs 2007,p.30

- Revitalize the regulatory and police making,
- Increase the efficiency of government bodies, and upgrade the level of service based on customers needs,
- Fight against corruption,
- Develop a culture of democratic governance based on transparency and participation and knowledge.

The mains objectives of this communication are:

- Enhancing the competence and efficiency of administration and civil society in terms of leadership and democratic governance.
- Developing the values and virtuous of strategic management and human resources by focusing on competence, merits and efficient rationalization and training in leadership ,
- Promoting transparency, evaluation of risk and internal control.

Our methodology consists of:

- Adopting a pragmatic and comparative approach in this analysis,
- Identifying the strengths and weaknesses in the Arabic governance system,
- Suggesting a strategy of development in democratic governance.

The Arab Spring was all over the world attracted the attention of many specialists from different fields, on the socio economic and cultural realities of this part of the planet. The concentration of wealth in the hands of a minority and autocrats in power failure and the opacity of its redistribution, corruption, absolute power, and especially the refusal of youth (Facebook Generation) to continue to accept this, are the detonators of the revolt in the Gulf, the Maghreb and elsewhere in Africa. The Arab Spring was not predictable.

Most studies today consider the revolutions that Arabs are claiming triggered a redistribution of wealth and the realization of human dignity within the society (Arabic) through building a new modern state based on transparency, efficiency and rationalization of power. In the midst of this debate are popular demands, including on constitutional reform, education, health, dignity governance and the fight against corruption. 50 years after the proclamation of independence of the countries of the Arab countries and African Union, it is clear that they understood that their economic and social stagnation in comparison with the economic vitality of some emerging countries Brazil, Russia, India and China is due to two major causes: a lack of transformational leadership and bad governance. With this in mind that the vast majority of these countries have adopted the strategic goal: African countries, emerging countries in 2025.

Specifically democratic governance is the key element of human development in its entirety. The success of this project is dependent on the establishment of a participatory development in terms of clear and shared vision, structures, skills, reliable information and communication and continuous risk assessment and that practical measure of support. In fact, the institutional capacity building and strategic actors in all countries of the world has become fundamental. The return of state capitalism today leads to other changes, including strengthening links between business and the rise of hedge funds. In this case it will draw on methods and scholarly approaches to strategy, including governance and ethical values in the process of wealth creation and balance of power. Taking into account the risks to the environment today is for people a source of anxiety, such as the phenomena of natural disasters, or cultural resistance and mental.

The concept of risk such a sociological concept cannot be treated as a pure objective reality. He proposes as an act, per formative engagement rather than simple fact. A risk is taken, is short, refuses, having been considered, calculated, and covered. The risk is a style of being in the world. It is the nature of moral commitment, ideological and practical interest to us in risk. More particularly, the emergence of cognitive and democratic governance in Arab countries comes with a challenge related to learning achievements and nature of planned development projects in the region (economic partnership, social peace, democratic processes) which faces a deficit including strategic and institutional size.

In this perspective the researches in this area do realize that poverty, not to say the misery of strategic thinking in the Arab and African countries. For example to achieve the vision 2025 in Africa should be put at the disposal of its member countries in the words of Kitsoro Kinzounza "a package of expertise "in the following forms:

- Education and Training
- Scientific Research and Innovation
- Consulting and expertise.

This package can't be validated without the establishment of democratic governance. This paper attempts to explore more closely the contribution of Think Tanks (TT) in the formulation and conduct of public action through passing of cognitive constraints of governance in order to legitimize power. It presents an approach in the light of recommendations of an international symposium which had held last year in Rabat (Morocco) would promote new mechanisms of integration of knowledge and expertise in the process of decision making on different terms: human organizational and strategic. What is likely to re-legitimize the power?

3. What's TT?

It is not easy to define the TT. Defined by Diane Stone and Mark Garnett who advance the following elements: according to these authors the TT are relatively autonomous organizations that are trying to inform or influence policy through intellectual arguments or analysis rather than lobbying . They are to bridge the gap between knowledge and policy. In this perspective *THE GLOBAL "GO-TO THINK TANKS"* 2010 provides a precise definition of TT³.

"TT are organisms That generate policy-oriented research, analysis, and advice on Domestic and International Issues in year effort to enable Policymakers and the Public To Make Informed Decisions about public policy issues. TT May Be Affiliated With Political Parties, Government, interest groups, private corporations or gold have constituted independent Nongovernmental Organizations (NGOs). Often thesis institutions act as a bridge Between the academic and policymaking Communities, Serving the public interest as independent voice That year translate Applied and Basic Research into a language and form Understand That Is, reliable, and accessible for Policymakers and the Public. Structured as permanent bodysuits, in contrast ad hoc with commissions or research panels, a "substantial portion TT devout of Their Financial and human resources to commissioning and publishing research and policy analysis in the Social Sciences: political science, economics, public administration and international affairs. The major outputs of thesis organisms are books, monographs, reports, policy briefs, conferences, seminars, formal

³ *THE GLOBAL "GO-TO THINK TANKS"* The Leading Public Policy Research Organizations In The World
Revised ,January 31, 2010

briefings and informal discussions With Policymakers, Government Officials, and key stakeholders".

The UNDP identifies think tanks as "[the] bridge between knowledge and power". Certainly, this is true; at their best, think tanks are the filters and synthesizers that facilitate the identification of policy issues, the design of policy solutions, and the implementation of and feedback on policy decisions. The proliferation, global expansion, and networking of think tanks have magnified the potential for them to research and develop solutions to global public policy issues of today.

Table 1 Global Distribution of Think Tanks by Region

Africa	8%
Asia	19%
Europe	28%
Latin America And the Caribbean	10%
Middle East an north Africa	4%
North America	30%
Oceania	4%

Source: THE GLOBAL "GO-TO THINK TANKS" The Leading Public Policy Research Organizations In The World, 2010, p.12

Table 2 Number of Think Tanks in the Word (2009)

Region	No of TT's	% of Total
Africa	503	8
Asia	1183	19
Europe	1750	28
Latin America And the Caribbean	645	10
Middel East an north Africa	273	4
North America	1912	30
Oceania	39	1
Total	6305	100

Source: THE GLOBAL "GO-TO THINK TANKS, p.13

The illustrations show that the part of Middle East and North Africa in the global distribution is only 4%. So the TT 's contribution in the process of strategic management is limited. And Arabic countries aren't classified between countries with the largest number of Think Tanks.

Table 3 Number of Think Tanks in the World 2009*

1	United States	1815
2	China	428
3	United kingdom	285
4	India	261
5	Germany	190
6	France	168
7	Argentina	132
8	Russia	109
9	Japan	108
10	Canada	97
11	Italy	88
12	South Africa	84
13	Sweden	74
14	Switzerland	71
15	Netherlands	57
16	Mexico	55
17	Romania	54
18	Israel	52
19	Taiwan	52
20	Belgium	51
21	Bolivia	51
22	Spain	50
23	Brazil	45
24	ukraine	45
25	Poland	41

Source: THE GLOBAL “GO-TO THINK TANKS, p.15

Table 4 Categories of Think Tanks

Category	Definition
Autonomous and Independent	Significant independence from any one interest group or donor and autonomous in its operation and funding from government.
Quasi Independent	Autonomous from government but an interest group (i.e. unions, religious groups, etc.), donor or contracting agency provides a majority of the funding and has significant influence over operations of the Think tank.
University affiliated	A policy research center at a university.
Political party affiliated	Formally affiliated with a political party.
Government affiliated	A part of the structure of government.
Quasi government	Funded exclusively by government grants and contracts but not a part of

Source: THE GLOBAL “GO-TO THINK TANKS

4. The Contribution of TT Strategic Analysis in the Arab Countries

The TT can provide many tools methodologies in developing strategies and participatory democracy in several areas: development of the knowledge economy, diplomacy, production expertise and experts, promotion of public debate, boosting the parliament involvement public opinion in decision-making, promotion of scientific research, mediation and crisis management and risk.

Who built these representations?

"All men are intellectuals, said Antonio Gramsci (1891 - 1937) in his prison notebooks, but all men do not function in society as an intellectual" already attracting attention to the existence of "professional intellectuals".

TT, Strategy and Dynamics of Crisis

The strategy is a concept of war. She thinks in terms of vision, threat, risk, competence, communication, transparency and imagination. The new governance is characterized by the authority and decision-making authority in many public policy networks within civil society and a drain of skills of national institutions on a vertical axis toward sub-national levels on the one hand, and to institutions and international networks, on the other.

According to Francis B. Huyghe "TT, literally" Think tank ", is an organization (...) bringing together experts, dedicated to research new ideas and seeking to influence public affairs' According to calculations by Professor James McGann two thirds of the Think tanks that exist today were established after 1970, more than half since 1980. Their numbers have increased fivefold between early 1970 and late 1990. The TT has taken root in the cradle of democracy and liberalism. In fact, the TT are born in the rubble of crises.

There are four steps (or waves) of creation of TT:

- The first extends from 1884 to 1927 (social protests and the first world; war);
- The second stage (1943-1973) includes the "thirty glorious capitalism" through events and highlights of the Second World War and the Cold War;
- The third phase (1973-1986) was accompanied by the stagflation and oil crisis;
- And the fourth great wave (1989-2011). It is a very eventful period (fall of the Berlin Wall, the attacks of September 11, 2001, financial crisis, Arabic spring) have strongly promoted the creation of new TT.

The TT consists of a multiple field research and studies. It is a source of expertise and strength of proposal increasingly necessary to address complex issues of combining the technical aspects of economic, legal, institutional and strategic. According to Auguste Comte, "it is ideas that govern the world." For Alexis. Tocqueville TT are 'intermediary bodies created to counterbalance the power of the majority whose function is to educate the people to political freedom and equality. These instruments created and animated by free individuals and equal to channel the energy of a democratic society".

These statements underscore the formidable power of these forces in the production and promotion of political debate and good governance. In a context characterized by the crisis and the emergence of these organizations "producers of ideas", the centers of strategic studies and TT are a significant example of these new political actors, these modes of governance that deliver new democratic values and shared expertise and make it more effective.

What model of TT for the Arabic countries of the 21st century? What can they serve?

Very little work has been devoted to the TT in this region (Maghreb and Francophone African or Arab).

The TT is a concept related to the Anglo-Saxon culture. The concept was designed in English and in the context of governance systems of the United States and England. It is the result of a tradition of pluralistic democracy. It is often difficult to translate into French or Arabic. The Arab and African countries like the developing countries need the TT very strong so they can contribute to the development of democratic global governance. But the level of this contribution is strongly conditioned by the level of democracy, to varying degrees in these countries. What these countries also lack is organization and investment "research that can help translate the proposals into public policy enforceable and enforced.

5. TT's Constraints in the Approach of Good Global Governance:

The TT in both Arab and African countries use a technique (the production of information, evaluation of the system of global governance) and political (promotion of public debate). But in practice they face many constraints: financial, institutional and sociological.

Financial and Human Constraints:

The TT always needs huge logistical human and financial to run their organizations. States, businesses and local communities do not have a tradition of funding scientific research. Often the actors are not aware of the relevance and usefulness of these institutions to the extent that power is generally centralized. So, TT can be regarded as the power.

In practical terms the TT will require financial autonomy or independence that is not obvious. According to the international ranking among the criteria for selection of the most successful TT is cited among others: the ability to sustain human skills, the level of financial organization, budget, number of contracts with the private sector. Which assesses the degree of independence of TT and their ability to guard against conflicts of interest with the aim of producing objective report and criticism?

Sociological Constraints:

They are linked to the dominant culture in the third generation of information and the ability of TT to meet increasing demand from the public demand more transparency and democracy. Sociological limits faced by TT in the Arab countries are complex and multiple. The democratic deficit in particular related to the malfunctions that mark the democratic institutions (parliament, courts of auditors, justice, social inequality) may negatively affect the optimal functioning of TT. The development of the culture of TT in the Arab countries in the context of good governance requires the adoption of a strategy of empowerment and institutionalization of the principles and values of transparency, accountability and performance in society. This is an essential component of the reinvention of the state.

The Arab countries face several challenges. The State in the 21st century faces makes the dilemmas of governance and power of the bureaucracy. He is caught between democracy and bureaucracy. The new powers of the bureaucracy lie essentially within the limits of both the strategic

management of knowledge, the knowledge economy than performance. In this context the charm of democracy is diffuse. It is in this case to build and reinvent the values of good citizenship. In fact, the strong nations are those that promote reconciliation between democracy and paradoxes of bureaucracy, hence the importance of TT in the process of change. Great nations are those which may here and now introducing revolutionary practices in the Authority by means of a governance so that the transparency of performance.

6. The Six Foundations for a Successful System of TT and Policy Analysis in the Arab Countries

The six benchmarks proposed in this study are an approach that can be invested in the process of developing a new culture of strategic analysis of public action to improve its performance as its political legitimacy.

Rethinking the Systems of Democratic Governance and Promote a Multidisciplinary Strategic Thinking:

We are talking today to the Arabic countries to rethink their systems of global governance in terms of participatory strategic planning opportunities, strengths and weaknesses and continuous risk assessment. The insistence on the strategic importance of TT as an instrument of a new generation of actors is crucial in the process of developing a new approach to making, communication and monitoring of public policies, and have a special place in international relations, the global production system, the knowledge society, democratic governance, respect for human rights and globalization.

This emphasis reflects the pressing need for governments to have an accurate, clear and appropriate, to help them understand their environment within which they operate, in a world where the population will exceed 9 billion people, and Global warming will increase by two points, but in a world experiencing the growing strength of China and India, which will lead to a profound reform of the global geopolitical map.

For comparison, the identification of growth factors and development of TT in the Anglo-Saxon is instructive in more ways than one. They are the result of liberalism, cultural and structural factors and development of democratic values in these liberal societies which have now become more open and responsive to the information revolution and e-governance.

Focusing More Reflection on The Manifestations of The Crisis of Democratic Governance:

The inability of African and Arab states to formulate a clear vision on the current situation, constraints and risks that threaten their integrity, identity and future of their generation gap and they are subject regarding the mechanisms of free thinking is evident.

These are likely to help identify problems and their explanation, then explore the future of the global human development in their region, and further develop their creative capacity in order to contribute to the enrichment of human civilization, in terms of thought and practice, hence the need to direct research projects, expertise and advice to the knowledge-based economies, innovation, and creating science and technology.

So in terms of their key role in developing the TT must maintain the support of civil society to achieve specific strategic objectives, with emphasis on threats brandished in Africa and the Arab world, and which are of a safe , that is to say relating to strategic security, educational, economic, cultural, food, health and environment, with the affirmation of their diplomatic and media presence in international organizations through the strengthening of their particular cultural diplomacy parallel to the global level. For the consolidation of dialogue between religion and civilization is a major contribution to the culture of peace and tolerance.

Create an Environment Conducive to the Development of TT and Public Policy Debate

The consolidation of democracy is an essential pillar of TT in Arabic countries. Thus, the emergence of the innovative nature of certain experiences such as that of Morocco should be appreciated and encouraged. They are characterized by the plurality of TT and their ability to use scientific controversy to arise in a large dynamic evaluation of the system of global governance, in accordance with existing international frameworks.

However such an approach can not succeed without enjoying the TT in this country of intellectual autonomy, organic and functional credibility and democratic legitimacy. Such a project should be based a set of principles such as design, innovation, imagination, realism and comprehensiveness in the reflection, participation and involvement of socio economic and skills in decision making strategic, with conservation of the main pillars of identity in the resolution of major problems, managing risks and threats in the era of globalization and crises.

Rebuilding TT Strong and Democratic Economy Based on Knowledge and Innovation

The importance of TT in the consecration of the values of tolerance, security and peace in the world and in all countries is crucial. So alongside the various partners and regional groupings, international, continental and global, because of the global nature of the TT in their relations with the state and businesses they can develop a new culture of democratic governance and cognitive. The pressing need for strong TT in Arab countries, is to help the state parliament, elected representatives and civil society in defining and developing clear strategic priorities and research platforms for debate, dialogue, and consultation, and to disseminate this new doctrines and expertise, academic theories and scientific studies, to bridge the gap between thought and practice, and strengthen democracy and the values of governance in these countries overall cognitive.

The TT will influence decision makers in the approach to major issues (horizontal integration and regional cooperation in the Mediterranean), and the development of civilizational values, strategic and human resources, and encouraging young people to strengthen their commitment to this geostrategic area.

Bridging the Gap between Knowledge and Policy Through the Creation of TT Strategists Brave and Powerful

In order to bridge the gap between knowledge and politics of Arabic countries need effective TT that are open about their socioeconomic environment, modern adopting a holistic approach and a scientific / pragmatic and objective in construction of a societal project advanced through the development of strategic capabilities, institutional and human state, parliament, local authorities and civil society and thus contribute to the achievement of global development to which citizens.

Such an approach can not succeed without taking into account the dangers which threaten security in its comprehensive sense in these countries and the control and implementation of development strategies consistent, and the design of structures for leadership training administration in the field of design strategy and an arsenal of internal control and ongoing evaluation of hazards, development projects, ensuring the transparency and the fight against corruption. The realization of the importance of TT as incubators of innovative policy solutions and Think tank to prepare politicians to good governance practices and professionalism in strategic management systems of governance and values of creativity and innovation.

But the success of TT depends on their capacity to drain the skills necessary human and firmness as to the consecration of the values of quality and honesty in their work, reports and studies and for an example of transparency and good practices. Otherwise, the value of the TT resides in the quality of the members who compose it.

Provide the Necessary Legislative and Financial Support to the TT

The TT will have to develop their financial independence and institutional scientific and moral approach to the expertise brought to the actors. For this purpose the TT will strengthen and consolidate the association agreements and cooperation protocols with all local stakeholders, national, and with civil society with the same interests and goals, as well as elected parliament, research centers, universities, opening with the youth and women.

The guarantee of institutional support, logistical and financial support is needed for these TT can carry out their tasks in accordance with international standards as incubators of educational action-oriented ideas, the distinction, competence, analysis and the influence of current policies, while maintaining the necessary independence. The assertion of such means is a sine qua non for better interaction between policy makers and academia, and an institutional and educational debate and consensus. Such interaction should be based on the design and sending of messages and reports clear policy for governments, public opinion and citizens in general.

Similarly we must ensure that strategic studies in Arab countries are subject teaching in universities and higher institutes of directors, to raise the cognitive level among Arab students and researchers in this field, and what to prepare scientifically evaluate their system of global governance on the basis of knowledge. Epistemologists correctly note "to assess that is changing."

7. Conclusion

The legitimacy of public action in Arab countries is dependent on the creation of democratic and institutional conditions conducive to the development of TT. These conditions are manifold may include:

- The availability of funding,
- The existence of supportive legislation,
- Political freedom and intellectual,
- The existence of rules of good governance,
- The independence of the State,
- The existence of good governance practices.

Now if some authors consider that the development of endogenous TT is hampered by the dominance of international organizations in developing public policies in developing countries with regard to abuse of the outsourcing decision in favor of including the World Bank. According to other reflections of the overwhelming majority of TT are far from reality. Only a minority, whereas in fact that nothing works, suggests that we change the vision, values and politics. Unlike the U.S. and TT are unsatisfactory because of the myth of world domination by the U.S., those of India, China and Brazil are very effective because they understood that the issue resides in the vision and not in technology.

Ultimately we are talking today to assess the performance of TT themselves and their involvement in the process of revitalization of the current global systems of governance in an era of crisis for how far they have a clear vision and shared future, reliable structures, skills, system of continuous assessment and risk communication in relation to the complexity of their tasks (conflict of interest). According to studies conducted in particular by Donald Abelson, James McGann, the TT can use various measures to assess the impact and value of their intervention through the calculation of their contribution to environmental public policy and civil society terms of output and impact. It's a great question, it seems, to what the political science and policy analysis can provide modern tools of analysis, relevant indicators and all the elements required response.

References

The global “Go-to Think Tanks” The Leading Public Policy Research Organizations In The World , Revised, January 31, 2010.

Les think Thanks, Edition du Félin, 2006.

Mohamed Harakat (2010). Les finances publiques à l'épreuve de la transparence et de la performance – Almaarif Aljadida, Rabat, 2010.

Mohamed Harakat (2011). Les finances publiques et les impératifs de la performance , L'Harmattan, Paris, 2011.

Réflexion stratégique et Think tanks dans les pays arabes – Centre International des études stratégiques et de gouvernance globale – REMA N° 30/2010.

Reddition des comptes et comptabilité dans les pays arabes: fondements législatifs et mécanismes, The Arab anti- corruption Organization (En arabe), Liban, 2007,

Administration de l'Impôt en France dans le Monde et en France » L' Harmattan - Paris- 2008.

Le contrôle des finances publiques dans les pays arabes » L'Organisation arabe de lutte contre la corruption –Liban (en arabe), 2009.

Le coût du non Maghreb –Université Caddi Ayyad - Friedérich Ebert Stiftung , 2010.

K. Dawkins (2003). Global Governance: The Balle over PPlanetary Power – Seven Stories Press: New York, USA.